Module VI: Issues in Collegiate Sports

In this module we explore the stakes and stakeholders associated with college sport. The growth in popularity of football and basketball and the increase in revenue for the NCAA and many college athletic programs has created a plethora of conflict among the values, important consequences and rights and responsibilities of many stakeholders in college sport. The responsibility of academic institutions to retain their academic integrity and also produce a profitable, winning athletic program places conflicting demands upon college presidents, athletic directors, coaches, players, alumni, advertisers, fans and communities. In this module we see and analyze many of the conflicts and consider some of the management options generated by interested parties and we will evaluate some of the options.

Learning Objectives and How to Achieve Them

After completing this module you should know and be able to do the following:

1. Identify the core values, important consequences and rights and responsibilities of key stakeholders in collegiate sports. [Accomplish this in the readings and video programs]

2. Identify several examples that illustrate ethical and social issues in collegiate sports. [Accomplish this in the readings and video programs]

3. Apply SAGE to decisions that affect collegiate sports. [readings, video programs and web site]

4. Recognize risks and benefits of BIG TIME college sports. [Accomplish this in the readings, video programs and class web site]

5. Recognize the role of the NCAA in college sport. [Accomplish this in the readings, video programs and class web site]

6. Identify issues raised by the Carnegie and the Knight Foundation critique of college sport. [Accomplish this in the readings below and on the class web site]

7. Critically think about issues in collegiate sport by using SAGE. [Accomplish this in the readings, video programs and the class web site]

1. Module Specific Information:

1.1 Outside the United States, and in many sports within the United States, elite sports are not interwoven with education. Club sports and other leagues provide the venue for competition around the world. In the United States, there is a tradition, at least in American football and basketball, that colleges provide what amounts to a minor league for professional football and basketball. It is principally in these sports, though it does happen occasionally in others, that college academic requirements for entrance, for continuation, and for graduation sometimes are compromised. The United States has developed somewhat peculiar educational institutions where sports entertainment is highly prized and financially rewarding.

Since colleges can be more than simply educational institutions, they have choices to
make regarding how many other activities are appropriate while maintaining their core mission and values. It seems clear that some institutions are better than others in reducing the conflicts between their academic missions and their athletic aspirations. Some have reduced the conflicts by lowering institutional academic standards and expectations and, through the provision of substantial academic support unavailable to other students, other colleges reduce the tension by lowering the athletic achievement expectations and permitting academic standards to prevail.

1.2 What is the NCAA?
The National Collegiate Athletic Association is the organization through which the nation’s colleges and universities speak and act on athletics matters at the national level. It is a voluntary association of more than 1,200 institutions, conferences, organizations and individuals devoted to the sound administration of intercollegiate athletics.

Through the NCAA, member colleges consider any athletics problem that has crossed regional or conference lines and has become national in character. The Association strives to maintain intercollegiate athletics as an integral part of the educational program and the athlete as an integral part of the student body. The NCAA also stands for good conduct in intercollegiate athletics and serves as the colleges’ national athletics accrediting agency.

The NCAA has grown dramatically in the past 40 years, with more than 600 new members since 1950.

The National Collegiate Athletic Association’s purposes are:

To initiate, stimulate and improve intercollegiate athletics programs for student-athletes and to promote and develop educational leadership, physical fitness, athletics excellence and athletics participation as a recreational pursuit.

To uphold the principle of institutional control of, and responsibility for, all intercollegiate sports in conformity with the constitution and bylaws of the Association.

To encourage its members to adopt eligibility rules to comply with satisfactory standards of scholarship, sportsmanship and amateurism.

To formulate, copyright and publish rules of play governing intercollegiate athletics.

To preserve intercollegiate athletics records.

To supervise the conduct of, and to establish eligibility standards for, regional and national athletics events under the auspices of the Association.

To legislate, through bylaws or by resolutions of a Convention, upon any subject of general concern to the members related to the administration of intercollegiate athletics.

To study in general all phases of competitive intercollegiate athletics and establish standards whereby the colleges and universities of the United States can maintain their athletics programs on a high level.

NCAA Division I, II and III Membership Criteria

Division I member institutions have to sponsor at least seven sports for men and seven for women (or six for men and eight for women) with two team sports for each gender. Each playing season has to be represented by each gender as well (Fall, Winter,
There are contest and participant minimums for each sport, as well as scheduling criteria.

For sports other than football and basketball, Div. I schools must play 100% of the minimum number of contests against Div. I opponents—anything over the minimum number of games has to be 50% Div. I. Men’s and women’s basketball teams have to play all but two games against Div. I teams, for men, they must play 1/3 of all their contests in the home arena. Schools that have football are classified as Div. I-A or I-AA. I-A football schools are usually fairly elaborate programs. Div. I-A teams have to meet minimum attendance requirements (17,000 people in attendance per home game, OR 20,000 average of all football games in the last four years or, 30,000 permanent seats in their stadium and average 17,000 per home game or 20,000 average of all football games in the last four years OR, be in a member conference in which at least six conference members sponsor football or more than half of football schools meet attendance criterion.

Div. I-AA teams do not need to meet minimum attendance requirements. Div. I schools must meet minimum financial aid awards for their athletics program, and there are maximum financial aid awards for each sport that a Div. I school cannot exceed.

Division II institutions have to sponsor at least four sports for men and four for women, with two team sports for each gender, and each playing season represented by each gender. There are contest and participant minimums for each sport, as well as scheduling criteria—football and men’s and women’s basketball teams must play at least 50% of their games against Div. II or I-A or I-AA opponents. For sports other than football and basketball there are no scheduling requirements. There are not attendance requirements for football, or arena game requirements for basketball. There are maximum financial aid awards for each sport that a Div. II school must not exceed.

Division III institutions have to sponsor at least four sports for men and four for women, with two team sports for each gender, and each playing season represented by each gender. There are minimum contest and participant minimums for each sport, as well as scheduling criteria—football and men’s basketball teams must play more than 50% of all games against Div. III NCAA members or schools that grant financial aid based on need only (not athletics ability). For sports other than football and basketball there are no scheduling requirements. Div. III does not award financial aid on the basis of athletic ability—only on the basis of need.

(Courtesy of the NCAA)

2. Key Terms and Concepts

NCAA: National Collegiate Athletic Association
NCAA, Division I
NCAA, Division II
NCAA, Division III

College institutions have an obligation to retain their academic standing by enforcing their academic requirements.

Conferences, such as the Big Ten, Middle America Conference, South Eastern Conference, and so on have their own specific rules and regulations which apply only to conference member institutions.

Carnegie and Knight Foundation reports over the years have attempted to set the stage for reform in college sport’s administrative structure and operations.
3. Brief Summary of Voices in Sport and Society Readings


For your convenience, the following are student summaries of most of the readings. It is not a substitute for the original, this is just for review.

Panel: Is the NCAA firing blanks?

Lawrence Hinman: Offers a brief overview of what issues the panel will be discussing. Some of the issues that will be discussed are ethics, respects, and punishment.

Mike McGraw: Discusses that the death penalty has truly only been used once at that was against SMU. The rule was passes 433 to 6. When he looked at the NCAA enforcement policy it show that the NCAA has gone back and forth between hard and soft enforcement of the rules. He also discovered that the band that hits a school the hardest is the one that affects the wallet. A good example is a band of television broadcasting of the school. Also noted by Mr. McGraw is when the NCAA divide into three divisions the enforcement of rules became harder to enforce.

Murray Sperber: He discusses the history of the NCAA. The NCAA was founded in 1905 during the presidency of Theodore Roosevelt. The NCAA became the center of the college sports world. He also talks about how Bear Bryant’s college career began. There is also a part on how he believes that the NCAA is driven and run by money and money only. The 40’s and the 50’s was the main period when the college fixes were taking place. The Ivy League was the founding group of college sports. The Yale bowl was the first big stadium for college ever built. Walter Byers is also discussed and described as the best director of the NCAA.

Dick DeVenzi: He believes that the NCAA is not firing blanks. He thinks the NCAA is very rich and powerful. He believes that university should worry more about educating the students then making money off of them. He also believes that players that bring in millions of dollars for colleges she be eligible to receive some of what they earn for their college. Agents are also discussed and Dick thinks that agent is a player’s best friend and help out players more than any other person. His last point is the he believes that players deserve the same respect that coaches and any other person deserve that make money for the university.

Richard Hilliard: The annual budget of the NCAA is 267 million dollars. Most of the money comes from the TV contract with CBS. As a member of the enforcement committee he believes that the NCAA does the best it can on enforcing and keeping intact all of the rules. The total staff of the enforcement team consists of 14 people. The committee’s main goal is to make sure that infractions do not take place. As a final thought Richard Hilliard doesn’t make the rules he just enforces all associations rules.

Dan Beebe: Dan’s main point is the he believes that college athletes should not be paid no matter how much money they make for the college. Now Dan is an investigator for the NCAA. He believes that college athletes deserve everything they need to help them get a better education.
Bob Bradley: Bob has been in sports over twenty years and believes that what is right for the kids is right for the NCAA

3.2 Sports and Higher Education: Academics, Athletics and Financial Opportunity

Dr William Shelton begins by discussing the relationship of athletics and the administration or governing boards of universities. He points out what these leaders of universities should do so that the athletic programs reflect the values of their institutions.

Dr. Shelton says that

- Presidents, Senior Administration, and governing boards need to say, “No, winning is not at all costs.”
- Administration and governing bodies are guilty of hypocrisy by
  - Saying they are concerned with the development of the student athlete and graduation rates, but actions really reflect that it’s only about winning.
  - Coaches get raises and lose their jobs based on winning and losing more often than any other factor.
  - They talk about how intercollegiate athletics is an integral part of our institutions, yet we don’t involve athletics in any other part of what goes on in our institution.

According to Dr. Shelton universities get rich from the success of their intercollegiate athletics and will exclaim that they are an integral part of the institution, however the institutions refuse to fund the athletics and force them to raise the money on their own.

Dr. Shelton says that we need fewer rules because issues of ethics and integrity require us to make decisions about what is the right thing to do, as opposed to what I have the right to do.

- If rules don’t say I can’t then I can.

Dr. Shelton also says that there are two big keys for institutions and intercollegiate athletics:

1. First employ the people that understand the values of our institution
2. The largest contributor to any intercollegiate athletic program should be the president of the university. Where the budgeting should come from.

Dick DeVenzio looks more into the relationship between NCAA rules and how the effect the athletes and their financial situations. According to Mr. DeVenzio the NCAA has never made a decision when the interest of the universities and athletes have diverged in which the athletes interest won out. Every decision that has been made by the NCAA has been to help the institutions. Mr. DeVenzio noted these things concerning institutions.

- They look out for the themselves before thinking about the athletes
- Institutions don’t get involved with any kind of decision involving athletes unless it becomes a public relations nightmare.
- They believe that the only thing that athletes deserve for bringing in millions of dollars for their institutions is a scholarship for a free education.
• Institutions do not agree with athletes making any type of extra money.

He also believes that institutions should treat athletes like regular American Citizens.

• Athletes should only be required to take the amount of classes that they can handle.
  o They should not have to take a full class load if they can’t handle it.
  o They should not have to take bogus classes just to make a full load of classes.

• Athletes should be able to work for extra money if the want to
• Athletes should be able to workout or practice for their particular sport for as many hours that they would like without being questioned.

Overall Mr. DeVenzio says that the main points institutions should follow for athletes are:

• Athletes should be treated as regular American Citizens
• Institutions should not pay athletes for playing at their schools
• Institutions should not give athletic scholarships
• Athletes should be able to receive money from boosters or other organizations without being penalized
• Athletes should be able to take as little or as many classes as they want during a semester
• Athletes should be able to work for extra money if the want

4. Brief Summary of Video programs including the DVD

Here are brief summaries of the video material provided for this module. Issues in Sport Teleweb students should view this module’s brief tutorial on the DVD.


This program is designed to explore ethical and societal issues that arise in institutions of higher education with regard to sports. Located within the sports and education issues module, this unit develops ethical and management issues not confronted elsewhere in the series.

We investigate the role that sports should play in college and university life and the role that colleges and universities should play in sports competition with:

• William E. Shelton, Ed.D
• Bill Curry
• Murray Sperber, Ph.D.
• Dick DeVenzio

Our goal is to help you recognize sports related ethical and managerial issues confronting institutions of higher education.

This program's learning objectives are:

• Recognize the distinct values, obligations and goals of academic institutions, sports teams and self-funding organizations.
• Describe cases where educational institutions may have sacrificed academic standards for sports success.
• Describe cases where educational institutions may have sacrificed intercollegiate sports excellence in favor of academic standards.
• Recognize the competing values, rights, responsibilities and
consequences confronting college trustees, presidents, faculty senates and athletic directors.

- Identify ethics and management issues arising from the attempt to balance athletics, academics and income.
- Recognize institutional integrity and institutional hypocrisy in sport management.

Summary—“Sports and Higher Education: Academics, Athletics and Financial Opportunity”

Sports and higher education in the United States have been intertwined since the early years of the twentieth century. The pursuit of excellence in both the body and the mind is laudable, but how the pursuit of excellence is carried out in collegiate sports creates management and ethics problems for institutions, alumni, students, athletes and virtually everyone else associated with higher education. Some believe that the integrity of our educational institutions is at stake in the way collegiate sports is handled. What are the rights and responsibilities which govern decisions in collegiate sports? What are the values that should drive these choices?

There are several competing values, rights and responsibilities which are difficult to manage coherently in the face of institutional demands for athletic success, institutional integrity and financial objectives.

Dr. Bill Shelton, President of Eastern Michigan University articulated ethics and management issues in collegiate sports confronting university presidents. It seems impossible to integrate the values, rights and responsibilities of the university together with the desirable consequences of a successful, winning sports program under present circumstances.

Coach Bill Curry points out the influence that corporate interests have on the athletic programs at major universities and that the coach is often employed as a fund raiser to obtain the ingredients necessary to win.

Dr. Murray Sperber claims that collegiate sports are not money makers for most colleges. Colleges often hide the true costs of their sports programs.

Dick DeVenizio agrees with Dr. Sperber that major college sports budgets are inflated and these sports programs are not expected to operate on tight budgets as are the academic departments of universities.

How should we make decisions in the academy regarding sports? What are the institutional and personal issues which impede institutional and personal integrity?

Dr. Shelton lamented that there seems to be no rational way to balance the demands of college sports and the academy. He characterizes the way that athletes are treated, with special requirements and rules that apply only to athletes, as an example of hypocrisy. One step toward a solution, he suggests, is that the university should be the major contributor of the money for the athletic program in order to keep control.

Dick DeVenizio pleaded for athletes to be treated like all other college students, without special rules singling them out and without special funding from the university supporting them. He believes that by letting the free market apply to college athletes some of the value conflicts inherent in the student athlete situation are eliminated.
Dr. Sperber believes that the college should pay the athlete in order to eliminate the value, rights and responsibility conflicts that arise in big time programs that now must play “scholar-athletes.”

The pursuit of excellence is a virtue, but the pursuit of a single virtue to the exclusion of other virtues becomes a vice. The reality that educational institutions can enhance their stature and financial stability through successful sports programs tempts all the stakeholders in higher education to tolerate the attitude that it is permissible to do whatever it takes to win.

In summary, we addressed the following questions: What is the role of sports in higher education? What are the obligations of the college to student-athletes? What obligations do student-athletes have to the college? How should the athletic program contribute to the rest of the college? What should the college expect of the athletic program? What are the ethical and managerial issues associated with sports in higher education? How should these decisions be made?

### 4.2 Program 22: Sports Associations: Issues in the NCAA’s Management of Sport

This program is designed to introduce sports and society issues as they arise in the context of a collegiate sports management organization. Using the example of the National Collegiate Athletic Association in the United States, we encounter criticisms that may be raised regarding any sports management organization. Examining the NCAA as a case study in sports management, we see the connection of ethics, management and decision-making in clear focus.

Critically examine NCAA management practices and decision making with:

- Richard Hilliard
- Dick DeVenzio
- Dan Beebe
- Professor Murray Sperber
- Bill Saum

Our goal is to help you recognize and appreciate ethics and management issues associated with sports management associations.

The learning objectives for this program are:

- Describe the values, rights and responsibilities pertaining to sports management associations such as the NCAA.
- Describe ethics and management issues which arise within sports associations.
- Recognize examples of conflicts of interest between the managing organization and the sport.
- Identify examples which illustrate cases where the NCAA faces ethics questions.
- Identify examples which illustrate NCAA actions to remedy ethical difficulties in collegiate sports.
- Provide management options to select ethical issues in sports association management.

Summary—“Sports Associations: Issues in the NCAA’s Management of Sport”

Sports associations, such as the National Collegiate Athletic Association (NCAA) play a major role in promoting and managing competitive college sports. The dominance of the NCAA provides it with virtual monopoly powers on certain aspects of college sports and as the dominant force in collegiate athletics the NCAA receives its
fair share of criticism. Does the NCAA advocate for the student athletes that are under their control? Or do they advocate for the interests of their member colleges and universities? Do they advocate for the betterment of the particular sports that they manage? Or do they advocate for all of these interests as some believe?

In many ways the NCAA may be the subject of criticism because of its success. The lucrative broadcast contracts negotiated by the NCAA for college sports provides a large capital budget for the NCAA to pursue their own or their members’ interests. Those who disagree with the NCAA have a difficult task when they challenge NCAA policies.

Dick DeVenzio, author of Rip Off U: The Exploitation of College Athletes and former First Team Academic All American point guard from Duke University, argues that the NCAA works to exploit athletes, not protect them. He believes that the NCAA has a “death grip” on pre-professional basketball and football, and it pursues its own interests over that of the athlete.

Professor Murray Sperber, author of College Sports Inc: The Athletic Department vs. The University, argues that recent lawsuits may change the power of the NCAA and the way college sports is managed. One recent decision ruled that collegiate sports is more entertainment than education by overturning the NCAA’s rule which limited the pay of assistant coaches to that of teaching assistants.

Bill Saum, NCAA representative for agents and gambling, knows there are many good reasons why the NCAA works to protect athletes. One of the good reasons is that the games must be fair or the networks will not renew their lucrative broadcast contracts.

Richard Hilliard, Director of Enforcement for the NCAA, reminds us that he just enforces the rules set by the 933 NCAA member institutions; he does not write the rules. He confronts those schools that try to gain advantages over other schools through violations of NCAA rules. When rule violations are alleged, the NCAA enforcement procedures provide a process allowing for additional evidence and repeated appeals.

What policy changes in the NCAA would be in the best interest of the student athletes? What are the values, important consequences and duties of the NCAA regarding their management of college athletics? How does the NCAA see their role in ethically managing college sports?

The NCAA faces ethics and management challenges in several respects. NCAA rules and enforcement are in question. Publicity surrounding certain NCAA enforcement actions have brought charges of inadequate and selective enforcement of what has been referred to as poorly crafted and inflexible rules.

Bill Curry, Chief Operating Officer for the National Consortium on Academics and Sport, former college coach and professional athlete, emphasizes that the NCAA is an association of colleges and universities, and as such, the colleges and universities have an obligation to take the steps necessary to improve the system.

Professor Sperber believes that history shows that the NCAA only takes action after a public relations problem is created. He argues that most NCAA actions are money motivated, not student-athlete or sport centered actions, and that their operating values should be changed.
Dan Beebe, Commissioner of the Ohio Valley Conference, argues that the NCAA’s past and present problems are less important than plans to make the NCAA better in the future. Dan related how sports provides opportunities for many and he argues that the NCAA preserves these opportunities. Surprisingly, he agrees that professional basketball and football should have their own minor leagues, and not rely on colleges to get their athletes ready to play professional sports.

Dick DeVenzio believes that the NCAA is the number one exploiter of athletes. He describes how some athletes are treated unfairly and how many NCAA rules work to the disadvantage of the athlete. He asks that athletes be treated the same as other students and that the NCAA should not suppress economic opportunities for athletes while they are in college.

Bill Saum responds that he takes pride in making a difference in collegiate sports by keeping the games fair and the athletes safe.

Rich Hilliard relates that he takes pride in making a contribution toward bettering the system and overseeing a fair process. He does not, however, take satisfaction in the penalties dealt to NCAA rule violators.

The NCAA is a rich and powerful force in college athletics. This organization bears a heavy burden in providing fair and just rules as well as fair and just enforcement of those rules, with the ultimate intention of insuring fair competition in college sports. The NCAA also is responsible for providing leadership in the effort to improve collegiate sports by developing an ethical environment for fair competition to thrive. With the enormous infusion of money into the NCAA, and into collegiate sports generally, we are likely to see more conflicts within the NCAA and more challenges to the NCAA control of collegiate sports.

In summary we addressed the following questions: How should the International Olympic Committee, the NCAA and other sports associations regulate the activities of teams and athletes? What are the ethical and managerial issues that arise in sports regulatory associations? What are the rights of student-athletes and the responsibilities of the governing associations to protect these rights? In what ways are governing associations working to insure the benefits of sports for their participating athletes and in what way do these associations protect colleges, universities and professional team owners at the athletes’ expense? How should decisions regarding the regulation of a sport be made?

5. Brief Summary of Web Site activities

5.1 There are several links on the web to NCAA, higher education and sport related sites.

5.2 There is an opportunity to post a position message where you take a position on an issue in college sport and explain how the relevant stakeholders are affected if your position was enforced. There are many possible issues for you to address.

5.3 The TeleWeb students have a required activity on the web and it is to address the Knight Commission 2 findings regarding the governance of collegiate sport. The Knight Commission recommendations and the history of Knight Commission 1 and Knight Commission 2 are accessed on the web. You are asked to take one of the recommendations and evaluate it using the SAGE method of critically thinking through issues in sport.
The following is a slightly modified for the study guide transcript of a power point presentation that is on the class web site courtesy of the authors of a study on the Knight commission. The transcript should provide sufficient information to determine the recommendations and some of the issues involved.

**NCAA Division I-A President’s Perceptions of the 2nd Knight Foundation Commission on Intercollegiate Athletics**

Dallas D. Branch, Jr., West Virginia University; R. Brian Crow, Slippery Rock University; Dennis R. Phillips, University of Southern Mississippi.

We first discuss the 1st Knight Commission and the NCAA changes made in response to the 1st Knight Commission. Then we discuss the 2nd Knight Commission and our Survey of college presidents regarding the 2nd Knight Commission recommendations.

**The First Try**

1989 - Knight Commission on Intercollegiate Athletics established by the Knight Foundation with a $5M grant.

Charged to reform intercollegiate athletics after Lou Harris Poll indicated that nearly 80% of Americans thought big-time collegiate sports was “corrupt” and out of control. *Published a series of three reports in 1991, 1992, and 1993 entitled Keeping Faith with the Student-Athlete, A Solid Start, and Beginning for a New Century.*

**A Model for Reform**

Proposed the “ONE-PLUS-THREE” Model of Reform where the:

"ONE" is COLLEGE PRESIDENT CONTROL that is directed toward the "THREE" major issues that are:

- ACADEMIC INTEGRITY;
- FINANCIAL INTEGRITY and
- ATHLETICS CERTIFICATION.

**Early Results**

1996 Knight Foundation dissolved the Commission

1996-2000 NCAA “drastically overhauled its governance based on a structure ‘lifted chapter and verse,’ according to the *New York Times* editorial, from the Commission’s recommendations.”

The “ONE”—PRESIDENTIAL CONTROL

Trustees should explicitly endorse and reaffirm presidential authority in athletics governance, delegate authority over finances, affirm the president’s authority for personnel, and annually review athletics programs.

The “ONE”—PRESIDENTIAL CONTROL

Presidents should establish control of the NCAA.

NCAA established Executive Council (16 CEO’s in Division I-A)

NCAA Division I-A Board of Directors (18 CEO’s) has full authority over legislation, policies, and budget.

The Second Try

Knight Commission Re-Convened August 28, 2000

20 Returning members
8 New members

Felt that NCAA changes were not enough, and that college athletics was still out of control.

Continuing Problems – Academic

- Division I-A football graduation rate fell 8 percent in the last five years
  - 55% of white players, 42% of black players
- Division I men’s basketball graduation rate fell 5 percent over the last five years
- 2001 Division I tournament
  - 26 of 64 teams graduated fewer than 35% of black players (7 teams had zero black graduates)
  - 35 schools graduation rates declined from 1999 report; only 19 schools increased

Continuing Problems – Arms Race

- 970 NCAA member institutions
  - Revenue $3 billion
  - Expenses $4.1 billion
- Capital Expenditures at Division I-A have increased 250% in the last 7 years
- 51% of Division I-A programs in the black with institutional support; only 25% without
- Over 30 college football and men’s basketball coaches earn over $1 million annually

Continuing Problems – Commercialization

- CBS – NCAA TV deal $6.2 billion for 11 years
- $8,946,906 per game
- NIKE – University of Michigan deal
  - $25-$28 million over 7 years
- Increase in bowl games from 18 to 25 in ten years
- Control of TV contracts by Conference Commissioners and BCS

General Knight Two Recommendations

- Worried that 40-60 of the biggest institutions will break from the NCAA
- Contend that, “Loss of academic integrity in the arenas and stadiums of the nation’s colleges and universities is far more destructive to their reputations than a dozen losing seasons ever could be.”
- Claim NCAA can’t govern independently
- Dempsey – we’ve “regulated ourselves into paralysis”
Knight Two Recommendations Continued

- Concerted grassroots effort including presidents and trustees, national higher education associations (ACE and AGB), conferences and the NCAA, faculty, athletic directors and coaches, and alumni - NO MENTION OF STUDENT-ATHLETES

- Creation of “Coalition of Presidents”
- Creation of “Institute for Intercollegiate Athletics”

Coalition of Presidents

- Similar recommendations, but with new oversight to pursue these proposals aggressively
- New “One plus Three” Model
  - One Coalition of Presidents
  - Three Academics

- The Arms Race
- Commercialization
- Membership from ACE, NCAA, AGB, and Division I-A Conferences
- Work collaboratively with NCAA Division I Board of Directors
- Financed Independently

Specific Knight Two Recommendations

Academics
Mainstream student-athletes
Improve graduation rates (by 2007, graduate 50% of athletes or be ineligible for conference championships or post-season play)
Scholarships until graduation
Reduction in playing, practice, and post-season time
Encourage NBA and NFL to develop minor leagues

The Arms Race
Reduce expenditures (especially Div. I-A FB scholarships)
Ensure Title IX compliance isn’t an excuse for soaring costs

Bring coaches’ compensation into line with prevailing norms across the institution
Coaches’ outside income be negotiated by school
Revise revenue distribution plan

Commercialization
Institutional control over game times, sponsors, etc
Consider all commercial contracts against the backdrop of traditional academic values
Minimize commercial intrusions in arenas and stadiums
Prohibit wearing of corporate logos on athlete uniforms
Support federal legislation to ban legal gambling on college sports

Comments by Stakeholders

Faculty Athletics Representatives

- Disappointed at focus on Division I-A
- Concerned that, “primary responsibility for reform in the very hands under which the problems intensified”
- Little discussion of faculty input
- Few concrete solutions

Further Observations

American Association of State Colleges and Universities

- “Analysis is weak, its recommendations tepid, and perhaps counterproductive”
- Coalition of Presidents would undercut the established NCAA governance structure
- Pitting one presidential group against another
- “Weakly conceived” and “limply
charged”
• A committee formed to study what we are unable to resolve

Observations of Cedric Dempsey – NCAA President

• New concerns raised by Commission are not “new”
• Wants “Coalition of Presidents” – if even necessary – to work with existing Division I Board of Directors
• Focus on what is wrong, not the positive experiences of vast majority of student-athletes
• “Money in and of itself is not what is bad - - how money is used is what can be bad.” Branch and Crow Observations
• Attended 1st meeting of re-convened Knight Commission – August 28, 2000
• Good intentions, but maybe not the best group to make decisions
• Stress cost containment, but meet in $400/night hotel and provide catered meals
• NCAA was frustrated that 10 years of reform were overlooked

Research Results:

How college presidents feel about the Knight Foundation recommendations.

• Knight Foundation Recommendations Survey 2002
• About the Survey Instrument
• 29 Question Survey
• Questions directly relating to the Knight Commission recommendations
• Sent to 115 Presidents of NCAA Division I-A Schools
• Pilot Study with 3 Division I-A University Presidents and 2 Ad Hoc members of the Commission to verify questions
• Likert Scale (1-5), 1 = Strongly Disagree, 2 = Disagree, 3 = No opinion, 4 = Agree, 5 = Strongly Agree
• 40 respondents (35%)
• Offered many research suggestions, little feedback

The following are the particular results from the questions asked the college presidents.

Academic Issues

• Same Admission Criteria
  o 70% agree or strongly agree
• Same progress toward degree requirements
  o 92% agree or strongly agree
• Same academic support services
  o No consensus; 44% agree or strongly agree
  o 37% strongly disagree
  o 19% no opinion
• Teams graduating < 50% of players ineligible for conference championship and post-season play
  o 56% agree or strongly agree (26% strongly)
  o 37% disagree or strongly disagree (15% strongly)

More Academic Issues

• Scholarships should be tied to athletes until they or their class graduates
  o 52% agree or strongly agree
  o 30% disagree or strongly disagree
• Reduce the length of playing season
  o 70% agree or strongly agree
  o 19% disagree
• Reduce the length of practice season
  o 59% agree or strongly agree
  o 22% no opinion
• Reduce the length of post-season
  o 63% agree or strongly agree
• NFL should be encouraged to develop a minor league system
  o 37% disagree or strongly disagree
  o 41% agree or strongly agree
  o 22% no opinion

Sports Arms Race

• Total # of grants-in-aid in football should be reduced
  o 59% agree or strongly agree
  o 19% no opinion
• Compliance with Title IX should not be excuse for escalating costs
  o 56% disagree or strongly disagree
  o 29% agree or strongly agree

• Coaches’ compensation should be in line with campus norms
  o 63% agree or strongly agree (37% strongly)
  o 33% disagree or strongly disagree (22% strongly)

More Sports Arms Race

• Agreements for coaches’ outside income should be negotiated with the institution
  o 78% agree or strongly agree (59% strongly)
• NCAA Revenue Distribution Plan should not be based in any form on wins and losses in the Division I Basketball Championship
  o No consensus
  o 37% agree
  o 33% disagree or strongly disagree

More Arms Race – Distribution Plan

• Distribution should be based in part on improving academic performance
  o 52% agree
  o 22% no opinion
• Distribution should be based in part upon enhancing the athletes’ college experience
  o 75% agree or strongly agree
• Distribution should be based in part upon Title IX compliance
  o No consensus: 41% disagree or strongly disagree
  o 48% agree or strongly agree

Regarding Commercialization

• Institutions alone should determine when games are played
  o 52% agree or strongly agree
  o 37% disagree or strongly disagree
• Institutions alone should determine how games are broadcast
  ○ No consensus: 48% agree or strongly agree
  ○ 33% disagree or strongly disagree
• Institutions alone should determine which companies are permitted to use their athletic contests as advertising vehicles
  ○ 74% agree or strongly agree

Commercialization Continued

• Institutions should consider commercial contracts against the backdrop of traditional academic values
  ○ 92% agree or strongly agree
• Institutions should minimize commercial intrusions in stadiums and arenas
  ○ 52% agree or strongly agree
  ○ 37 disagree or strongly disagree
• Uniforms and other apparel should not bear corporate logos
  ○ 44% disagree or strongly disagree
  ○ 33% agree or strongly agree
• Institutions should support federal legislation to ban legal gambling on college sports in Nevada
  ○ 89% agree or strongly agree

Commercialization Continued

• College presidents should address illegal gambling on their campuses
  ○ 92% agree or strongly agree
• The Knight Foundation Commission on Intercollegiate Athletics serves a useful purpose in the governance of college sport
  ○ 59% agree or strongly agree
  ○ 26% disagree or strongly disagree

Researcher’s Discussion

• Not surprisingly, Presidents agreed with most of the Commission’s academic recommendations
  ○ Exception is academic support services – ambivalent
• Reduction in playing season, practice time, and post-season activities, although not specific
  ○ Contradicts NCAA allowing 12th DI FB game and adding new Football Bowl games
• Graduation rate tied to post-season play
  ○ Most agreed; but questions abound about how to calculate graduation

Re: Arms Race

• In favor of reducing FB scholarships
  ○ No mention of specific numbers of total squad members
• Coaches’ compensation in line with campus norms
  ○ What are campus norms? Admin or faculty? Market driven?
• Revenue Distribution
  ○ Based on wins and losses - no consensus
  ○ Some feeling that it should be based on academic performance and college experience
  ○ No consensus whether it should be based on Title IX compliance

Re: Commercialization

• Institutional control over game times and dates
  ○ Conference USA
• Institutional control over sponsors and advertisers
  o Strong opinion about control
• Commercial contracts in light of traditional academic values
  o Strong agreement that commercialization should not encroach on reputation and dignity of higher education
• Conundrum about sponsor logos and signage
  o They like the money, but worry about the intrusion
• Gambling
  o Proactive about their campuses; also against legal gambling in NV

Need for Future Research on These Issues

• “Amateurism”
• Graduation Rates
• Gambling
• Commercialism
• Security
• Enforcement
• Escalating Salaries
• Gender Equity
• Facility “Arms Race”


• Do you believe the NCAA acts in the interests of student athletes? Do you believe that sports associations provide adequate leadership for the improvement of sports competition?
• How should colleges manage their sports programs? Should colleges bend the admission rules to enhance their sports success? Should colleges even have athletic programs?
7. Self Test for Module 6

1. Sports are profitable for most colleges and universities.
   (a) true
   (b) false

2. Collegiate sports are an integral part of American universities but not foreign universities.
   (a) true
   (b) false

3. In general, college athletic programs are inexpensive to operate but are growing in size while many other university programs face cut backs.
   (a) true
   (b) false

4. Collegiate sports provides for more than just financial rewards for select colleges, they provide special personal development opportunities for students.
   (a) true
   (b) false

5. Athletes are being exploited if the university is earning money off of their efforts, because anyone who makes money off of another’s efforts is exploiting them.
   (a) true
   (b) false

6. Athletic scholarships are one form of pay for athletic performance and are truly no different than a cash payment.
   (a) true
   (b) false

7. Athletic programs in colleges and universities are the same as the philosophy and geology departments with respect to their contributions to academic institution.
   (a) true
   (b) false

8. NCAA Division 1 Colleges and Universities operate their athletic programs under the same rules and obligations than NCAA Division 3 Colleges and Universities.
   (a) true
   (b) false

9. Collegiate sports programs can create moral conflicts for administrators when
   (a) admission standards are lowered to recruit athletes
   (b) athletes receive special treatment in disciplinary matters
   (c) sports programs are growing when academic programs are being cut
   (d) all of the above

10. Dick DeVenzo argued that athletes should be treated the same as other students, no better and no worse.
    (a) true
    (b) false
11. The NCAA can be seen as an association of colleges and universities organized to advance the interests of the member colleges and universities.
(a) true
(b) false

12. The NCAA has no obligation to enforce the rules agreed to by the member institutions upon the member institutions.
(a) true
(b) false

13. Dick DeVenzio argues that it is in the economic interests of the NCAA to limit the economic opportunity of college athletes.
(a) true
(b) false

14. The NCAA has requirements for academic progress toward a degree which are the same as those which apply to the non-athlete.
(a) true
(b) false

15. The NCAA requirements for member colleges and universities to maintain at least 15 sports teams is seen as an important element in maintaining non-revenue sports in university competition.
(a) true
(b) false

16. The NCAA is criticized as taking action on behalf of the student-athlete only when they have public relations crises.
(a) true
(b) false

17. How does Dick DeVenzi refer to NCAA?
(a) National College Athletic Association
(b) National Conspiracy Against Athletes
(c) Need Claims Against Athletes
(d) National Course Abusing Athletes

18. Some colleges would give _______________ instead of money to get around the NCAA rules and used it as a recruiting tool.
(a) products
(b) bogus jobs
(c) gifts
(d) all of the above

19. Dick DeVenzi claims the NCAA has not done a wonderful job for...
(a) sports bureaucrats
(b) athletes
(c) athletic entertainment industry
(d) middle managers

20. According to Dick DeVenzi, what percentage of high school graduates in America choose not to go on to college?
(a) 70%
(b) 50%
(c) 40%
(d) 20%
21. Dick DeVenzio thinks the NCAA should treat athletes like

(a) special individuals
(b) prima donnas
(c) other American citizens
(d) none of the above

22. Dick DeVenzio praised Coach Dean Smith as one of the finest developers of young people in the history of college sports. What does Coach Smith sometimes urge players to do who have exceptional talent?

(a) leave school early for the NBA
(b) don’t get involved in sports
(c) both a and b
(d) none of the above

23. What does Dick DeVenzio believe universities should do when it comes to playing athletes?

(a) universities should not pay athletes
(b) they should not prohibit athletes from making money
(c) both a and b
(d) none of the above

24. Bill Shelton, President of Eastern Michigan University believes it is time for what to happen in collegiate sports?

(a) athletes should get a piece of the pie
(b) no scholarships should be given
(c) both a and b
(d) none of the above

25. There are several competing values, rights and responsibilities which are difficult to manage coherently in the face of institutional demands for:

(a) athletic success
(b) institutional integrity
(c) financial objectives
(d) all of the above

26. According to Dr. Murray Sperber, collegiate sports are not ________ for most colleges.

(a) required
(b) mandatory
(c) entertaining
(d) money makers

27. Dr. Shelton characterizes the way that athletes are treated, with special requirements and rules that apply only to athletes, as an example of:

(a) sincerity
(b) hypocrisy
(c) defeat
(d) authenticity

28. One solution Dr. Shelton suggests for the above problem, would be that the university should be the major contributor of the ________ for the athletic program in order to keep control.

(a) awards
(b) scholarships
(c) money
(d) advertising
29. Dick DeVenzio believes that by letting the free market apply to college athletes some of the value conflicts inherent in the student athlete situation are:
   (a) instituted
   (b) created
   (c) established
   (d) eliminated

30. Outside the United States, and in many sports within the United States, elite sports are not interwoven with _______.
   (a) experience
   (b) education
   (c) intuition
   (d) all of the above

31. Bill Shelton says that “...we have a society today where losing is __________.”
   (a) acceptable
   (b) unprofitable
   (c) not acceptable
   (d) forgivable

32. Which of the following did Bill Shelton refer to as a non-revenue sport:
   (a) football
   (b) track
   (c) basketball
   (d) baseball

33. The NCAA is federated into ________ divisions.
   (a) four
   (b) three
   (c) two
   (d) fifty

34. The NCAA was founded in _______.
   (a) 1890
   (b) 1941
   (c) 1905
   (d) 1920

35. When Wingett College hired an independent consulting firm to find out what they could do to make their college more attractive to prospective students, the firm’s recommendation was to:
   (a) spend more money on recruiting top football players
   (b) get a basketball team
   (c) get a football team
   (d) advertise their sports program

36. The NCAA was the sense of right and wrong for whom?
   (a) college sports
   (b) professional sports
   (c) Little League sports
   (d) none of the above

37. Of the hundreds of pages of the NCAA rule book, which of the rules are voluntary?
   (a) physical guidelines
   (b) medical guidelines
   (c) moral guidelines
   (d) none of the above

38. What is the purpose of the NCAA?
   (a) create safety rules
   (b) create level playing ground
   (c) create competition among athletes
   (d) both a and b
39. The NCAA rules were written by whom?

(a) coaches  
(b) athletic directors  
(c) parents  
(d) both a and b

40. The NCAA consists of how many colleges and universities throughout the United States?

(a) 100  
(b) 933  
(c) 1000  
(d) 500

41. According to Bill Curry one of the functions of today’s coaches and athletic directors is:

(a) clown  
(b) drill sergeant  
(c) fundraiser  
(d) none of the above

42. College athletes have to pretend that ______ is their main priority even though it is not in many cases.

(a) athletics  
(b) fun  
(c) academics  
(d) none of the above

43. Dr. Bill Shelton believes that it is impossible to:

(a) to understand the politics of the NCAA and how powerful of an industry it is  
(b) to make a determination between division I athletics and division II  
(c) to integrate the values, rights and responsibilities of the university together with the desirable consequences of a successful, winning sports program under present circumstances  
(d) have more than one governing body of the NCAA due to the amount of pressure put upon the collegiate association of directors

44. One-way of balancing the demands of college sports and the NCAA is:

(a) give all of the power to the athletes and let them determine how much schooling they need  
(b) let the university be the major contributor of the money for the athletic program in order to keep control  
(c) give individual power to the presidents of the university  
(d) the NCAA is too powerful to give up the power that they have, therefore it will require the assistance of the government

45. Dr. Murray Sperber claims that collegiate sports programs are:

(a) not money makers for most colleges and that colleges often hide the true costs of their sports programs  
(b) are the most important institution in America because it turns boys into men  
(c) encumbered by the NCAA which generates so much money for the government that the government leaves it alone  
(d) are the ultimate in sports excellence because most kids play at this point for the love of the game
46. Why is the NCAA the subject of so much criticism on a daily basis?

(a) the NCAA allows colleges to take advantage of the system
(b) recent allegations that involve money laundering within the NCAA
(c) the NCAA has been so successful and exerts a large amount of influence over colleges
(d) athletes are tired of dealing with the problems associated with being amateur athletes

47. One recent court decision involving the NCAA implied:

(a) that student athletes should be allowed to make their own decision about whether to work or not
(b) that is truly a professional level of sports
(c) that collegiate sports is more entertainment than education by overturning the rule which limited the pay of assistant coaches to that of teaching assistants
(d) that the NCAA owes money to all the universities due to recent court findings that determined that the NCAA was holding more money than they should have

48. How are the rules for the NCAA administered?

(a) by the NCAA president who makes the ultimate determination on what is right in the NCAA
(b) the rules are enforced by the 933 NCAA member institutions
(c) the universities gather to make the new NCAA rules each year
(d) the rules are made by a governing body of 11, where one member is the deciding factor in split decisions

49. The NCAA has faced recent public allegations due to:

(a) the abuse of money by the NCAA governing board and the explicit use of money for their own personal privileges
(b) publicity surrounding certain NCAA enforcement actions that have brought charges of inadequate and selective enforcement of what has been referred to as poorly crafted and inflexible rules
(c) the misuse of public television for their own personal advertisement uses, that include the ability to spread good worth onto the NCAA and the institutions they represent
(d) from the government because of taking advantage of the power and authority that it has over the universities

50. The NCAA is responsible for doing what for collegiate athletics?

(a) providing the athletes with enough spending money to meet their individual needs
(b) making sure that not one university reigns supreme over any of the others
(c) providing leadership in the effort to improve collegiate sports by developing an ethical environment for fair competition to thrive
(d) enforcing drug policies which require annual drug testing for the use of drugs such as steroids which provide athletes with an unfair advantage

Module Six.

1. b, 2. a, 3. b, 4. a, 5. b, 6. a, 7. b, 8. b, 9. d, 10. a, 11. a, 12. b, 13. a, 14. b, 15. a, 16. a, 17. b, 18. b, 19. b, 20. a, 21. c, 22. a, 23. c, 24. a, 25. d, 26. d, 27. b, 28. c, 29. d, 30. b, 31. c, 32. b, 33. b, 34. c, 35. c, 36. a, 37. b, 38. d, 39. d, 40. b, 41. c, 42. c, 43. c, 44. b, 45. a, 46. c, 47. c, 48. b, 49. b, 50. c